



# MatchingDonors.com

## Bioethical Decision-Making

### Teacher information

---

#### Summary:

Students use a bioethical decision-making model to select the best course of action for a kidney patient who is considering listing their profile on the MatchingDonors.com website. They may also select the best course of action for a person who is considering donating one of their kidneys.

#### Core concepts:

- Science provides knowledge, but values are also essential to making effective and ethical decisions about the application of scientific knowledge.
- Inquiry involves asking questions and locating, interpreting, and processing information from a variety of sources.
- Inquiry involves making judgments about the reliability of the source and relevance of the information.
- Societies must decide on proposals which involve the introduction of new technologies. Individuals need to make decisions which will assess risks, costs, benefits, and trade-offs.

#### Class time required:

Two or three 40-minute class periods plus homework. (The amount of class time required depends on whether the teacher chooses to have students complete the second bioethical question.)

#### Prerequisite:

Students should have completed the *Winning the Waiting Game* activity.

#### Teacher preparation:

- Review the PowerPoint entitled *MatchingDonors.com*. Teacher copy of slides with room for teacher notes is provided on pages 3 through 8.
- Arrange for access to a computer and projector for showing the PowerPoint.
- Set up a poster that looks like the chart shown on Slide 2 of the *MatchingDonors.com* PowerPoint. You can use this poster to collect data on the students' answers to the question on Slide 2 and at the end of the PowerPoint.

- Each student will need 1 copy of *MatchingDonors.com: Bioethical Decision-Making - The Patient's Perspective*.
- If you opt to have students address the second ethical issue, each student will need 1 copy of *MatchingDonors.com: Bioethical Decision-Making - The Donor's Perspective*.

## During Class

1. Distribute 1 small (3" x 3" square) sticky note and 1 copy of *MatchingDonors.com: Bioethical Decision-Making - The Patient's Perspective* to each student.
2. Show Slide 2 on the PowerPoint *MatchingDonors.com*
  - Read the question at the top of the slide.
  - Ask students how they would answer the question. Point to the possible answers on the bottom of the slide.
  - Show them to the classroom poster. Ask them to place their sticky note above the answer they have selected on the classroom poster.
3. Use the PowerPoint *MatchingDonors.com* to step students through the use of the bioethical decision-making model as it applies to the question "Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?" Encourage students to share and discuss their answers with the entire class.
4. For homework or in class, students work INDIVIDUALLY to complete steps 8-10 of the bioethical decision-making model.
5. Optional: Ask students to volunteer to read their position statements to the class. The class could peer review the position statements based on the following criteria:
  - Identifies a course of action
  - Identifies the principles and values that support course of action.
  - Identifies the benefits of this course of action.
  - Explains why the benefits outweigh the risks.

**If additional class time is available**, consider having students approach the ethical issues associated with the organ donor's perspective.

1. Distribute 1 copy of *MatchingDonors.com: Bioethical Decision-Making - The Donor's Perspective* to each student.
2. Students could work in small groups to complete steps 1-7 of the bioethical decision-making model for the question "Should a donor give a kidney to a person listed on the MatchingDonors.com website?" For homework or in class students could work INDIVIDUALLY to complete steps 8-10 of the bioethical decision-making model.
3. Ask students to volunteer to read their position statements to the class.

This project was generously funded by Science Education Partnership Award R25RR023285 from the National Center for Research Resources. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the National Center for Research Resources or the National Institutes of Health.

## Teacher PowerPoint Notes:

**MatchingDonors.com**

A difficult choice



---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?

Yes	Maybe Yes	Not Sure	Maybe No	No

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Bioethical Decision-Making**

**The Issue:**  
Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?

1. Explain why this is an ethical issue.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Bioethical Decision-Making

2. List **stakeholders** who might be affected by the decision.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Bioethical Decision-Making

3. List **others** who could assist in or influence the decision-making.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Bioethical Decision-Making

4. Brainstorm a list of 3 possible **courses of action**. Write them in the chart.

Courses of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Principles	Values

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

5. Record **pros** (benefits) and **cons** (risks) for each course of action.

Courses of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Principles	Values

---



---



---



---



---



---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

6. Identify the **ethical principles** that support each course of action.

Courses of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Principles	Values

---



---



---



---



---



---

## Ethical Principles

<b>Autonomy</b>	<b>Right to decide</b>
<b>Beneficence</b>	<b>Do what is best</b>
<b>Non-maleficence</b>	<b>Do no harm</b>
<b>Justice</b>	<b>Do what is fair</b>

---



---



---



---



---



---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

7. Identify the **values** that support each course of action.

Courses of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Principles	Values

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Values

<b>Compassion</b>	Act to relieve the suffering of others
<b>Confidentiality</b>	Keep a secret
<b>Fidelity</b>	Keep a promise; fulfill an obligation
<b>Golden Rule</b>	Treat others as you would like to be treated
<b>Honesty</b>	Tell the truth
<b>Integrity</b>	Conform to your own principles/values
<b>Privacy</b>	Keep from public view
<b>Respect</b>	Preserve the dignity of self and others

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

8. Based on the chart and the principles and values that are important to YOU....

**What do YOU think is the best course of action?**

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

9. Use the following questions to develop an **individual position statement** to support the course of action that you selected.

- What principles and values support your choice?
- What are the benefits of this course of action?
- Why do the benefits outweigh the risks?

Be prepared to read your position statement to the class

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?

Yes	Maybe Yes	Not Sure	Maybe No	No

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

10. Did using the bioethical decision-making model affect your position on this issue? Explain why, or why not.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Bioethical Decision-Making

**Should a donor give a kidney to a person listed on MatchingDonors.com?**

Use the Bioethical Decision-Making Process to consider this ethical issue and select the best course of action.

- Work with a team to complete steps 1-7
- Work individually to complete steps 8 and 9.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



# MatchingDonors.com – *Teacher Answer Key*

## Bioethical Decision-Making - The Patient's Perspective

---

### The issue

**Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?**

Work with your team to complete steps 1-7.

1. Explain why this is an ethical issue.  
***Should the patient post her profile on MatchingDonors.com?***  
***Student answers may include:***
  - ***There are competing principles and values.***
  - ***There is no one answer that is best for everyone.***
  - ***Different people may make different decisions.***
2. List stakeholders who may be affected by the decision.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Student answers will vary but may include: the patient, the donor, the doctor, the patient's family, loved ones or friends, the transplant center, other people who are waiting for a kidney (both on MatchingDonors.com and on the UNOS waiting list), insurance companies, people who own or work for the MatchingDonors.com company, etc.***
3. List others who could assist in or influence the decision-making.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Student answers will vary but may include: Religious groups, social workers, psychologists, doctors who might be involved in a second opinion, nurses, other patients awaiting kidney transplants, people at the dialysis center, websites and blogs, videos, books, etc.***
4. Brainstorm a list of 3 possible courses of action. Write the possible courses of action in the first column of ***Bioethical Decision-Making Chart*** on page 4.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Possible courses of action may include:***
  - ***List on the website and accept any offers from kidney donors.***
  - ***List on the web site and consider possible donors later***
  - ***Spend more time looking at the website and gathering input from a variety of people and written sources.***
  - ***Ask friends and other family members to donate a kidney.***
  - ***Take out a newspaper advertisement or advertise on a billboard or TV show.***
  - ***Do not list on the website. Wait for a cadaver kidney from the UNOS system.***
5. Record pros (benefits) and cons (risks) for each course of action. Write the pros and cons in the second and third column of the ***Bioethical Decision-Making Chart***.

6. Table 1 lists and defines the four ethical principles.

**Table 1: Ethical Principles**

<b>Ethical Principle</b>	<b>Definition</b>
Autonomy	Right to decide
Beneficence	Do what is best
Non-maleficence	Do no harm
Justice	Do what is fair

Identify the ethical principles that support each course of action. Write the ethical principles that support each course of action in the fourth column of the **Bioethical Decision-Making Chart**.

7. Table 2 lists and defines values that may be important to people when they make decisions.

**Table 2: Values**

<b>Value</b>	<b>Definition</b>
Compassion	Act to relieve the suffering of others
Confidentiality	Keep a secret
Fidelity	Keep a promise; fulfill an obligation
Golden Rule	Treat others as you would like to be treated
Honesty	Tell the truth
Integrity	Conform to your own values
Privacy	Keep from public view
Respect	Preserve the dignity of self and others

Identify the values that support each course of action. Write the values that support each course of action in the fifth column of the **Bioethical Decision-Making Chart**

**Work individually to complete steps 8 and 9.**

8. Based on the chart and the principles and values that are important to you, what do you think is the best course of action?

***Students should work individually and their answers should vary. They may even select a course of action that is not represented on their team's table.***

9. Use the following questions to develop an individual positions statement to support the course of action that you selected. Write your position statement on a separate sheet of paper.
- What principles and values support your choice?
  - What are the benefits of this course of action?
  - Why do the benefits outweigh the risks?

***Student answers will vary but should include information that relates to each of the three questions.***

### Bioethical Decision-Making Chart

Course of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Ethical Principles	Values
		<p><b><i>Student answers will vary</i></b></p>		

# MatchingDonors.com

## Bioethical Decision-Making - The Donor's Perspective

---

### The issue

**Should the donor give a kidney to the person listed on MatchingDonors.com?**

Work with your team to complete steps 1-7:

1. Explain why this is an ethical issue.  
***Should the donor give a kidney to a person listed on MatchingDonors.com. Student answers may include:***
  - ***There are competing principles and values.***
  - ***There is no one answer that is best for everyone.***
  - ***Different people may make different decisions.***
2. List stakeholders who may be affected by the decision.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Student answers will vary but may include: the donor, the patient, the doctor, the donor's family, loved ones or friends, the transplant center, other people who are waiting for a kidney (both on MatchingDonors.com and on the UNOS waiting list), insurance companies, people who own or work for the MatchingDonors company, etc.***
3. List others who could assist in or influence the decision-making.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Student answers will vary but may include: Religious groups, social workers, psychologists, doctors who might be involved in a second opinion, nurses, other patients awaiting kidney transplants, people who have experienced living kidney donation, websites and blogs, videos, books.***
4. Brainstorm a list of 3 possible courses of action. Write them in the ***Bioethical Decision-Making*** chart.  
***Encourage a diversity of responses. Possible courses of action may include:***
  - ***Contact your doctor and a counselor to get more information on the consequences of kidney donation.***
  - ***Donate to a person on the website.***
  - ***Contact a local transplant center and offer a kidney to the UNOS system.***
  - ***Wait to see if a new person appears on the website who is desperately in need of a new kidney.***
  - ***Sign an organ donor card to donate a kidney after your death.***
  - ***Sign an organ donor card and wait until you are older.***

- **List yourself as a donor on the website but be very careful about who might get your kidney.**
  - **List on the web site and consider possible donors later**
  - **Spend more time looking at the website and gathering input from a variety of people and written sources.**
5. Record pros (benefits) and cons (risks) for each course of action. Write the pros and cons in the second and third column of the **Bioethical Decision-Making Chart**.
6. Table 1 lists and defines the four ethical principles.

**Table 1: Ethical Principles**

<b>Ethical Principle</b>	<b>Definition</b>
Autonomy	Right to decide
Beneficence	Do what is best
Non-maleficence	Do no harm
Justice	Do what is fair

Identify the ethical principles that support each course of action. Write the ethical principles that support each course of action in the fourth column of the **Bioethical Decision-Making Chart**.

7. Table 2 lists and defines values that may be important to people when they make decisions.

**Table 2: Values**

<b>Value</b>	<b>Definition</b>
Compassion	Act to relieve the suffering of others
Confidentiality	Keep a secret
Fidelity	Keep a promise; fulfill an obligation
Golden Rule	Treat others as you would like to be treated
Honesty	Tell the truth
Integrity	Conform to your own values
Privacy	Keep from public view
Respect	Preserve the dignity of self and others

Identify the values that support each course of action. Write the values that support each course of action in the fifth column of the **Bioethical Decision-Making Chart**

**Work individually to complete steps 8 and 9.**

8. Based on the chart and the principles and values that are important to you, what do you think is the best course of action?

***Students should work individually and their answers should vary. They may even select a course of action that is not represented on their team's table.***

9. Use the following questions to develop an individual positions statement to support the course of action that you selected. Write your position statement on a separate sheet of paper.
- What principles and values support your choice?
  - What are the benefits of this course of action?
  - Why do the benefits outweigh the risks?

***Student answers will vary but should include information that relates to each of the three questions.***

### Bioethical Decision-Making Chart

Course of Action	Pros (Benefits)	Cons (Risks)	Ethical Principles	Values
		<p><b><i>Student answers will vary</i></b></p>		